# Advisory Committee (AdvComm) Report

## Wednesday Plenary

IETF 58

# Outline

- What is AdvComm?
- Current Reality
- Identified stress points
- Requirements
- Recommendations
- Next steps

# What is AdvComm?

- A committee formed to advise the Internet Architecture Board (IAB)
- Members
  - Leslie Daigle, IAB Chair & Chair of AdvComm
  - Harald Alvestrand, IETF Chair
  - Lynn St. Amour (ISOC President)
  - Fred Baker (Chair, ISOC Board of Trustees)
  - Brian Carpenter (ex-IAB Chair, ex-member ISOC Board of Trustees)
  - John Klensin (ex-IAB Chair, former IESG)
  - Steve Crocker (member, ISOC Board of Trustees)
  - Russ Housley (IESG Security Area Director),
  - Bernard Aboba (member, IAB)

# AdvComm, cont'd

- Timeline
  - IETF 58: Presentation of findings & recommendations
  - mid-November:  publish Internet Draft documenting the findings & recommendations
  - mid-December: Incorporate comments, issue final document & shutdown
- Acknowledgements
  - Thoughtful input from RFC Editor, Secretariat and IANA in response to AdvComm's questions

# Goals & Non-Goals

- Goals
  - To review the IETF administrative structure and relationships (RFC Editor, IETF Secretariat, IANA)
  - To propose structural changes necessary to improve the functioning of the IETF
- Non-goals
  - Reorganization of IETF internal structure (IESG, IAB)
  - Changes to the standards process

# IETF Functions & Organizations

| Function | Known as (within the IETF) | Organization |
|---|---|---|
| IESG Support | Secretariat | Foretec/CNRI |
| IAB Support | ISOC/Secretariat | ISOC, Foretec/CNRI |
| WG Support | Secretariat | Foretec/CNRI |
| Community Support | Secretariat | Foretec/CNRI |
| IETF Meetings | Secretariat | Foretec/CNRI |
| RFC Publication | RFC Editor | USC/ISI |
| Parameter Registration | IANA | ICANN |
| Legal, insurance, etc. | (largely invisible) | Provided by ISOC |

# IETF Support Organizations

- Internet Society (ISOC)
  - Since 1992, the organizational home of the IETF, IAB, IESG and IRTF.
- Corporation for National Research Initiatives (CNRI)/Foretec
  - Since 1987, CNRI has provided the IETF Secretariat.
  - Foretec: A for-profit subsidiary of CNRI.
  - No MOU or contract in place with Foretec/CNRI
- University of Southern California Information Sciences Institute (USC/ISI)
  - RFC Editor activity organized as a project within ISI
  - For 30 years, the RFC Editor was Jon Postel, manager in the Networking Division of USC/ISI.
  - Role of the RFC Editor and USC/ISI is detailed in RFC 2555.
  - Contract in place between ISOC and USC/ISI
- Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers (ICANN)
  - Non-profit formed in 1998.
  - Has responsibility for domain name administration and parameter assignment, including IANA
  - IANA MOU in RFC2860

# Identified stress points

- Informal (not supported by MOU or contract) relationships creates vagueness about management responsibility, makes it difficult to determine how to act on IETF community consensus.
- IETF operational procedures and knowledge recorded only in people's minds.
- IETF institutional records stored across multiple organizations.
- Significant manual labor & coordination required for common tasks (lack of automation).
- Negative trends in meeting attendance, revenue
    - http://www.ietf.org/proceedings/03mar/slides/plenary-3/index.htm
    - And the IETF Chair's presentation of the year to date income and expenses trends underscore the continuing problem

# Requirements

- The AdvComm composed a set of requirements on the administrative organization of the IETF
  - intended as a constructive structure
  - not the set of requirements for change
  - some of these are already met

# Requirements – Stewardship

- Accountability
  - The IETF leadership needs to be accountable to the IETF community.
  - This includes accountability for budgetary decisions.
- Persistence & accessibility of records
  - IETF history needs to be adequately documented.
  - IETF needs to maintain and support the archiving of all of its working documents so as to ensure future accessibility.

# Requirements – Resource Management

- Clarity in relationships
  - The IETF needs clear contractual relationships with organizations supporting basic services.
  - IETF needs to respect the needs of the supporting organizations (no micromanagement)
- Budgetary autonomy
  - The IETF needs to make its own budgetary decisions.
- Budgetary unity
  - The IETF is supported by money from multiple sources: meeting fees, donations in cash or in kind.
  - The IETF needs to consider all sources of income & expenses as pieces of one budget.
- Flexibility in service provisioning
  - The IETF needs to commission  additional services as appropriate (e.g. tools support)
- Administrative efficiency
  - The IETF should operate with the minimum of administrative overhead

# Requirements – Working environment

- Service automation
  - For the non-rocket-science aspects of supporting our work, we ensure minimal friction (i.e., delays)  through appropriate use of automated process management
- Tools
  - The IETF needs to have an environment that supports the creation and operation of the type of tools needed by participants (e.g., as noted by the PROBLEM WG).

# Recommendations

- AdvComm believes that change in the IETF's structure is required.
  - Current structure does not meet requirements
  - Change needed to meet budgetary challenges
  - Change needed to address concerns raised by the PROBLEM WG.
- Proposes formalization of the IETF organization
  - the administration of the IETF would remain accountable to the IETF leadership and community; the goal would be to ensure that lines of responsibility and accountability were clearer;
  - this formalized IETF would be responsible for managing financial resources  (revenue and expenses) directly;
  - this formalized IETF would directly negotiate  and administer any appropriate contracts.

# AdvComm next steps

- Report
  - revised, if needed, from this discussion
  - sent to draft editor (aim:  early next week)
  - will be draft-iab-advcomm-00.txt
  - comments reviewed & final version planned for mid-December
- AdvComm will be closed upon delivery of its report to IAB
- Comments re. data gathering, or the report document:
  - advcomm@ietf.org
- Other comments/questions:
  - IAB/IETF Chairs, IAB, IESG